

Eido Shimano's lineage...
80 posts • Page 1 of 4 • 1234

by Shodo on Tue Nov 23, 2010 2:01 am

Well, I am sure everyone here has seen the "Shimano Archive"... I read through it quite a few times and I have a serious question about lineage.

I have seen numerous places that have stated something to the effect of "Eido Shimano was given Dharma Transmission by Soen Nakagawa in a public ceremony in 1972", but something I read in the archives seems to contradict this history.

Robert Aitken Roshi, had heard "rumors" that Eido Shimano never received transmission (or had had his transmission revoked by Soen), so he went to Japan to inquire about this in 1984... this is what he found:

[http://www.shimanoarchive.com/PDFs/1984 ... Kiefer.pdf](http://www.shimanoarchive.com/PDFs/1984...Kiefer.pdf)

And further along in the archives this would seem to be corroborated by the lineage charts. Here is the lineage chart from Soen Nakagawa's temple, Ryutaku-ji (scroll to the bottom, unless you can read Japanese)

[http://www.shimanoarchive.com/PDFs/2010 ... ineage.pdf](http://www.shimanoarchive.com/PDFs/2010...ineage.pdf)

And here is the lineage chart from Daitoku-ji

[http://www.shimanoarchive.com/PDFs/2010 ... ineage.pdf](http://www.shimanoarchive.com/PDFs/2010...ineage.pdf)

What I gather from this, is that Eido Roshi is **not** a Roshi... Not an heir of Soen.

What does this mean?

What does this mean for the heirs of Eido...?

The Dude: Yeah, well. The Dude abides.

The Stranger: The Dude abides. I don't know about you but I take comfort in that. It's good knowin' he's out there. The Dude. Takin' 'er easy for all us sinners.

Shodo

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Shodo on Tue Nov 23, 2010 5:29 pm

I know this is a touchy subject loaded with landmines - but doesn't anyone have anything to say?

The Dude: Yeah, well. The Dude abides.

The Stranger: The Dude abides. I don't know about you but I take comfort in that. It's good knowin' he's out there. The Dude. Takin' 'er easy for all us sinners.

Shodo

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Carol on Tue Nov 23, 2010 6:24 pm

I do. A teacher's lineage is not so important as his or her conduct.

I'm not much impressed by rumors or speculations about so-and-so's transmission. There have been fine teachers whose transmission or lack of it has been called into question. I'm also certain that historically such things have happened many times over the centuries when teachers became angry with or disappointed in their dharma heirs. Such is human nature. Still the teaching has come down to us through all that ... for which I am grateful.

This solitary brightness hears, understands and teaches the Dharma. ~Linji

Carol
Global Moderator

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by simpleton on Tue Nov 23, 2010 6:59 pm

I don't see why this has to be a touchy subject - assuming we're still allowed to speak honestly on forums like this.

I am surprised at Carol's post that reads to me like support of Shimano as a teacher.

Shodo's post & documents are just further evidence (as if it were needed!) that if we want to study authentic Zen, we should choose our teachers (and lineage) with care. This advice is especially pertinent if we train in the west.
simpleton

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Carol on Tue Nov 23, 2010 7:16 pm

simpleton wrote:

I don't see why this has to be a touchy subject - assuming we're still allowed to speak honestly on forums like this.

I am surprised at Carol's post that reads to me like support of Shimano as a teacher.

Shodo's post & documents are just further evidence (as if it were needed!) that if we want to study authentic Zen, we should choose our teachers (and lineage) with care. This advice is especially pertinent if we train in the west.

I believe Eido Shimano's conduct disqualifies him as a teacher, as I've said elsewhere.

Rumors about his lineage don't make or unmake "authentic" Zen to me. There are teachers with unquestioned lineage whose Zen may be someone questionable these days. There are teachers whose lineage may be questionable (like Phillip Kapleau, and his dharma heirs) whose Zen is quite "authentic." So that's just not the telling criteria for me. This solitary brightness hears, understands and teaches the Dharma. ~Linji

Carol
Global Moderator

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Nonin on Tue Nov 23, 2010 7:32 pm

Although Eido Shimano's sexual misconduct was reprehensible, he trained some excellent priests who are now excellent teachers.

I know three of his dharma heirs quite well -- Roko Chayat, Genjo Marinello, and Denko Mortensen -- and I wouldn't hesitate to recommend them to those seeking a teacher. I also wouldn't hesitate sending my own students to study with either of them.

Hands palm-to-palm,

Nonin
Soto Zen Buddhist Priest. Transmitted Dharma Heir of Dainin Katagiri Roshi.

Abbot and Head Teacher, Nebraska Zen Center / Heartland Temple, Omaha, Nebraska, USA

<http://www.prairiewindzen.org>

Nonin
Global Moderator

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by simpleton on Tue Nov 23, 2010 7:57 pm

I believe Eido Shimano's conduct disqualifies him as a teacher, as I've said elsewhere.

Carol, Apologies for taking your first comment out of context.

Last edited by simpleton on Tue Nov 23, 2010 8:16 pm, edited 1 time in total.

simpleton

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by simpleton on Tue Nov 23, 2010 8:05 pm

Nonin,

I've also met & trained with some people in that lineage, inclusive of at least one "dharma heir". I have nothing against those people (hence will not name names etc), but from a perspective of Zen training I was frankly not impressed. I would not recommend.

Each to their own.

simpleton

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Shodo on Tue Nov 23, 2010 8:18 pm

Carol wrote:

I'm not much impressed by rumors or speculations about so-and-so's transmission.

As far as I can tell, this is neither rumor or speculation.

Even Andy Jiro Afable acknowledges it (One of Eido's dharma heirs):

"At this point the documents that are in public view make revelations that are cumulatively impossible to explain or defend, and the significantly alter perceptions of the "history of transmission" depicted in Namu Dai Bosa."

And later he says:

"The lineage itself will be seen as problematic."

[http://www.shimanoarchive.com/PDFs/2010 ... _Board.pdf](http://www.shimanoarchive.com/PDFs/2010..._Board.pdf)

The Dude: Yeah, well. The Dude abides.

The Stranger: The Dude abides. I don't know about you but I take comfort in that. It's good knowin' he's out there. The Dude. Takin' 'er easy for all us sinners.

Shodo

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by **Jok_Hae on Tue Nov 23, 2010 8:56 pm**

Shodo wrote:

Carol wrote:

I'm not much impressed by rumors or speculations about so-and-so's transmission.

As far as I can tell, this is neither rumor or speculation.

Even Andy Jiro Atable acknowledges it (One of Eido's dharma heirs):

"At this point the documents that are in public view make revelations that are cumulatively impossible to explain or defend, and the significantly alter perceptions of the "history of transmission" depicted in Namu Dai Bosa."

And later he says:

"The lineage itself will be seen as problematic."

[http://www.shimanoarchive.com/PDFs/2010 ... _Board.pdf](http://www.shimanoarchive.com/PDFs/2010..._Board.pdf)

So now what?

Where do thoughts come from?

Kwan Um School of Zen New Haven Zen Center

Jok_Hae

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by **Shodo on Tue Nov 23, 2010 10:43 pm**

So now what?

I don't know...

What would usually happen if there was a teacher with a 40 year history of improprieties with his students... who said they had transmission but that was discovered to be a lie - but who had been appointing thier own teachers?

What would folks say if this person had been a nobody? Just some person who had ebayed their robes?

What is supposed to happen now?

The Dude: Yeah, well. The Dude abides.

The Stranger: The Dude abides. I don't know about you but I take comfort in that. It's good knowin' he's out there. The Dude. Takin' 'er easy for all us sinners.

Shodo

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Nonin on Tue Nov 23, 2010 11:44 pm

Some people say that Eido-roshi's transmission from Soen Nakagawa is suspect. Some say it was complete. Some say that Eido Shimano went through dharma transmission with another teacher before he studied with Soen-roshi. I, like Carol, am not interested in either speculation or rumor or debating about the subject. Eido Shimano transmitted a handful of teachers, and they will carry on the lineage, whatever that may be. They are all recognized by other Zen teachers, Rinzai and Soto, and are full members of the American Zen Teachers' Association (AZTA).

Kapleau-roshi was never fully transmitted by Yasutani-roshi, but established himself as the progenitor of a vibrant lineage. His main dharma heir, Bodhin Kjolhede, has established himself as a respected teacher and has transmitted his own disciples. All are recognized by their peers both in and out of the AZTA.

There are many ways to complete dharma transmission, say, when the original teacher dies or there is a break between master and disciple. Sometimes the master will disown a disciple for spurious reasons, especially when the master gets old and decrepit. I've seen this happen. What's important in these cases is that the disciple either complete his or her training with another master or continue the tradition even if there is a break between her or him and the master.

As a sidelight, even though his transmission with Kapleau-roshi was complete, Bodhin Kjolhede wanted to complete the koan curriculum that Philip Kapleau didn't complete with Yasutani. Bodhin's disciple, Sevan Ross, had completed the curriculum with James Ford, a teacher in the Kennett-roshi and Sanbo Kyodan lineages, so Bodhin then

completed the curriculum with Sevan. This is somewhat un-orthodox, studying under your disciple, but it worked in this case and linked Bodhin with Yasutani in a roundabout way.

Hands palm-to-palm,

Nonin

Soto Zen Buddhist Priest. Transmitted Dharma Heir of Dainin Katagiri Roshi.

Abbot and Head Teacher, Nebraska Zen Center / Heartland Temple, Omaha, Nebraska, USA

<http://www.prairiewindzen.org>

Nonin

Global Moderator

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by just on Wed Nov 24, 2010 1:08 am

I am sorry to add anything here, it is very difficult. There are many students, monks and teachers that are in the line of Eido's teaching. So it is a big burden on them, the persons involved and the whole community

that follow within this group, especially the women that were the target.

So it is obvious that my remarks will be out of line.

First:

There is a student, who is very inspired in the way, and who advances to become a teacher under Eido's approval. He may have worked hard, more than we can imagine, given his best, his all, and finally saw results of his practice. So Eido was his teacher.

A dilemma comes out: The student, now a Roshi, thinks: this man helped me, questioned me, spurred me on, this man had good intentions for me, he tried to show me the tradition of enlightened life...

He is my good angel, my benefactor, my teacher.

Unfortunately, the man was a sex addict.

Without questioning the place: dokusan room, the place the innermost Zen teachings are communicated,

the time, sesshins were the nice field, and no thought as to the personal damage to the women involved,

people in truth, and breath and wider still.

So to those who have been made practitioners, followers, stream enterers, teachers under Eido, a big question holds:

I was helped so much, but he fucked up so many, real people, and so much of his previous history, in dharma terms.

Now i am a made man, the teachers and practitioners think, but with the help of a man, a teacher, a delegated emissary of the Jap Roshi, so so much invested, seen and done...

WHAT NOW!?

Are you the offspring of Eido or of the Buddha Dharma?
Disown the man, now, at once, and accept that you were guilty too.
Yes, The teachers that held a closed eye- say you are sorry!
the students-- say you are sorry for not raising the question!

We dont see no fault, there is none, who are you fooling...

And was there any truth in any behavior, Aitken would have spit in his face and thrown him out into the streets. None of this would have happened. But sadly, soft hearts, many hopes, given over to posterity to solve. even still, he is still representing.

Forget the bugger Eido.
Zen Buddhism is absolutely not in the least dependent on such names as Eido, even not on much bigger and truer what names there are.

And where is the man who will disown Eido as his teacher, accept, understand, apologize, and still stay strong, his own master...
the thing true teachers have in mind, contrary to fups like Eido.

Please excuse me for so much bs. im sorry.
just

by Jok_Hae on Wed Nov 24, 2010 2:04 am

Shodo wrote:
So now what?

I don't know...

What would usually happen if there was a teacher with a 40 year history of improprieties with his students... who said they had transmission but that was discovered to be a lie - but who had been appointing thier own teachers?

What would folks say if this person had been a nobody? Just some person who had ebayed their robes?

What is supposed to happen now?

People will make choices. Some will choose to learn from his successors. Some will not.
That's their call, not ours.
Where do thoughts come from?

Kwan Um School of Zen New Haven Zen Center

Jok_Hae

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Jundo Cohen on Wed Nov 24, 2010 8:35 am

I am sure that if one digs deep enough into any of our blood families, there will be black sheep, babies born out of wedlock, scandals, skeletons in the closet. I've heard that my maternal grandfather was a real son-of-a-bitch, prone to use his fists and the like.

I'm not.

One cannot always judge the children by the parents.

Gassho, J
Founder Treeleaf Zendo, Japan. Member SZBA AZTA. Treeleaf is an online Sangha for those unable to commute to a Sangha, w/ netcast Zazen (www.treeleaf.org/sit-a-long/with-jundo-and-taigu/) & all of a Soto Sangha (www.treeleaf.org). Nishijima/Niwa

Jundo Cohen

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Shodo on Wed Nov 24, 2010 5:05 pm

Would he (and his successors) been accepted if the above information had been known back in 1972?

If lineage does matter then shouldn't somebody find out if Eido Shimano is actually a dharma heir of Soen?

If lineage does not matter then why does the AZTA even matter?

The Dude: Yeah, well. The Dude abides.

The Stranger: The Dude abides. I don't know about you but I take comfort in that. It's good knowin' he's out there. The Dude. Takin' 'er easy for all us sinners.

Shodo

by Nonin on Wed Nov 24, 2010 5:07 pm

Moderator's Note: Please remain on topic, which in this case is Eido Shimano's lineage and what happens to it now. Posts that veer into meta-discussions will be removed.

There is a long, involved thread about Eido Shimano's sexual misconduct and what ZSS is doing about it now. If you want to discuss this or make statements about it, please post to that thread. It's titled "Sexual Misconduct by Buddhist Teachers and it's in the Modern Zen Teachers forum under Teachers and Sanghas.

Hands palm-to-palm,

Nonin

Soto Zen Buddhist Priest. Transmitted Dharma Heir of Dainin Katagiri Roshi.

Abbot and Head Teacher, Nebraska Zen Center / Heartland Temple, Omaha, Nebraska, USA

<http://www.prairiewindzen.org>

Nonin

Global Moderator

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Nonin on Wed Nov 24, 2010 5:40 pm

Shodo asked:

Would he (and his successors) been accepted if the above information had been known back in 1972?

Eido Shimano is not and hasn't ever been a member of the AZTA.

Also, the above information is not definitive. The papers shown are not formal lineage papers given from master to disciple. They are informal lineage diagrams that only show Soen Nakagawa's formal, public dharma heirs, whom I assume were given inka, which is full transmission in that tradition. In Rinzai Zen, you can be a fully authorized teacher without full transmission, or at least that's my understanding of it. For instance, Sasaki-roshi has authorized about a dozen of his dharma heirs to teach independently. None of them have received inka, but some are AZTA members. It's different in Soto Zen, which is the only tradition that I can speak definitively about.

The only way to know Eido Shimano's lineage is through his lineage papers. I haven't seen them, and I assume that you haven't either, so we are discussing something that neither of us has definitive information about and are only speculating. There are members of this board who may have definitive info about this, but they are not participating on this thread.

Hands palm-to-palm,

Nonin

Soto Zen Buddhist Priest. Transmitted Dharma Heir of Dainin Katagiri Roshi.

Abbot and Head Teacher, Nebraska Zen Center / Heartland Temple, Omaha, Nebraska, USA

<http://www.prairiewindzen.org>

Nonin

Global Moderator

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Denko on Wed Nov 24, 2010 6:47 pm

Shodo wrote:

Well, I am sure everyone here has seen the "Shimano Archive"... I read through it quite a few times and I have a serious question about lineage.

I have seen numerous places that have stated something to the effect of "Eido Shimano was given Dharma Transmission by Soen Nakagawa in a public ceremony in 1972", but something I read in the archives seems to contradict this history.

Robert Aitken Roshi, had heard "rumors" that Eido Shimano never received transmission (or had had his transmission revoked by Soen), so he went to Japan to inquire about this in 1984... this is what he found:

[http://www.shimanoarchive.com/PDFs/1984 ... Kiefer.pdf](http://www.shimanoarchive.com/PDFs/1984...Kiefer.pdf)

And further along in the archives this would seem to be corroborated by the lineage charts. Here is the lineage chart from Soen Nakagawa's temple, Ryutaku-ji (scroll to the bottom, unless you can read Japanese)

[http://www.shimanoarchive.com/PDFs/2010 ... ineage.pdf](http://www.shimanoarchive.com/PDFs/2010...ineage.pdf)

And here is the lineage chart from Daitoku-ji

[http://www.shimanoarchive.com/PDFs/2010 ... ineage.pdf](http://www.shimanoarchive.com/PDFs/2010...ineage.pdf)

What I gather from this, is that Eido Roshi is *not* a Roshi... Not an heir of Soen.
What does this mean?
What does this mean for the heirs of Eido...?

Well.

The Robert Aitken 'thing' doesn't really mean/disprove anything.

The Ryutakuji lineage chart is somewhat troublesome.

The Daitokuji thing will not open in a browser, so I don't know.

On the other hand: There is a picture of the traditionally given scroll at the inka ceremony, "Done!", on page 133 in the book "ENDLESS VOW" which says (besides "done!"): "To Mui Shitsu from Mitta Kutsu September 5, 1972 for official acknowledgement of inka."

This scroll (on occasions at least) used to hang in the dokusan room at New York Zendo. Abbot of Egely Monastery - TaikyoJi in Denmark. Head Teacher of Rinzaï Zen Buddhist Society (Denmark). Transmitted Dharma Heir of Eido Shimano. Member of American Zen Teachers Association

<http://www.taikyoji.dk>

Denko

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by **Nonin** on **Wed Nov 24, 2010 8:23 pm**

Denko,

I have the book and have looked at the calligraphy. The stamps and the signature say that it was done by Soen Nakagawa, so this would be his acknowledgment of Eido Shimano as his dharma heir.

As an aside, in Soto Zen we are given lineage papers (ketchimyaku) when dharma transmission is completed. Are there similar papers given in Rinzaï Zen when disciples are authorized to teach (I don't know what the term is for this) or when inka (the seal of dharma transmission) is given? Or, is the scroll the only official acknowledgment of inka?

Hands palm-to-palm,

Nonin
Soto Zen Buddhist Priest. Transmitted Dharma Heir of Dainin Katagiri Roshi.

Abbot and Head Teacher, Nebraska Zen Center / Heartland Temple, Omaha, Nebraska,
USA

<http://www.prairiewindzen.org>

Nonin
Global Moderator

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Shodo on Wed Nov 24, 2010 11:05 pm

The Daitokuji thing will not open in a browser, so I don't know.

The names listed as heirs of Soen Nakagawa at Daitoku-ji are:
Suzuki Munetada
Kyudo Nakagawa
Eisen Gotou

The Robert Aitken 'thing' doesn't really mean/disprove anything.

This is true by itself, but I think it gains in strength when seen along with the lineage charts from Ryutaku-ji and Daitoku-ji... It seems that Eido's transmission was unofficial. But why would Soen leave Eido at DaiBosatsu as the teacher there and not replace him? The Dude: Yeah, well. The Dude abides.
The Stranger: The Dude abides. I don't know about you but I take comfort in that. It's good knowin' he's out there. The Dude. Takin' 'er easy for all us sinners.

Shodo

by Denko on Thu Nov 25, 2010 8:49 am

Nonin wrote:
Denko,

I have the book and have looked at the calligraphy. The stamps and the signature say that it was done by Soen Nakagawa, so this would be his acknowledgment of Eido Shimano as his dharma heir.

As an aside, in Soto Zen we are given lineage papers (ketchimyaku) when dharma transmission is completed. Are there similar papers given in Rinzai Zen when disciples are authorized to teach (I don't know what the term is for this) or when inka (the seal of dharma transmission) is given? Or, is the scroll the only official acknowledgment of inka?

Hands palm-to-palm,

Nonin

At Dharma Transmission (inka) I was given, besides a similar calligraphy to the one in the book, a certificate in english with the lineage on it. So I suppose that is about the same as in Soto

At the acknowledgement of my 'status' as Dharma Teacher some years earlier I was also given a (simpler) certificate to that extend.
Abbot of Egely Monastery - TaikyoJi in Denmark. Head Teacher of Rinzai Zen Buddhist Society (Denmark). Transmitted Dharma Heir of Eido Shimano. Member of American Zen Teachers Association

<http://www.taikyoji.dk>

Denko

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Denko on Thu Nov 25, 2010 9:02 am

Shodo wrote:

.. It seems that Eido's transmission was unofficial.

But why would Soen leave Eido at DaiBosatsu as the teacher there and not replace him?

No, it was not unofficial. As I believe you can read in "Namu Dai Bosa" it actually happened - and in public with many witnesses including several zen masters (Roshis), who also functioned as 'gates' for Eido Shimano. In other words, several Roshis were part of this transmission ceremony.

Why Eido Shimano is not on the Ryutakuji paper is another question, but that does not disprove actual events.

Soen left Eido at NYZ as the teacher. Dai Bosatsu is mainly Eido's and his sangha's creation.

Hope this clears this thing up.

Abbot of Egely Monastery - TaikyoJi in Denmark. Head Teacher of Rinzai Zen Buddhist Society (Denmark). Transmitted Dharma Heir of Eido Shimano. Member of American Zen Teachers Association

<http://www.taikyoji.dk>

Denko

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Christopher on Thu Nov 25, 2010 4:07 pm

Nonin wrote:

Eido Shimano transmitted a handful of teachers, and they will carry on the lineage, whatever that may be. They are all {...} full members of the American Zen Teachers' Association.

It seems to me that this statement says more about the AZTA's lack of discernment than the supposed legitimacy of any Shimano successors.

As I stated in my letter to the ZSS Board, his successors by definition studied with him very closely over many years. In that time they either saw what he is and accepted it, or they didn't even notice it in the first place. Both scenarios are depressing, so for me that lineage is pretty much dead, regardless of what the papers may say. The fact that the successors are even today continuing to celebrate Shimano as a "Founding Abbot Emeritus" or some such thing, shows just how disconnected from reality they really are.

Christopher

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Denko on Thu Nov 25, 2010 5:28 pm

Christopher wrote:

Nonin wrote:

Eido Shimano transmitted a handful of teachers, and they will carry on the lineage, whatever that may be. They are all {...} full members of the American Zen Teachers' Association.

It seems to me that this statement says more about the AZTA's lack of discernment than the supposed legitimacy of any Shimano successors.

As I stated in my letter to the ZSS Board, his successors by definition studied with him very closely over many years. In that time they either saw what he is and accepted it, or they didn't even notice it in the first place. Both scenarios are depressing, so for me that lineage is pretty much dead, regardless of what the papers may say. The fact that the successors are even today continuing to celebrate Shimano as a "Founding Abbot Emeritus" or some such thing, shows just how disconnected from reality they really are.

AZTA is not a 'judging' entity, so this doesn't say anything whatsoever about AZTA.

As to 'founding abbot': I too have severe problems with that (and would never 'celebrate' that). I was told by E.S. that Soen Nakawa was considered founder - of course of NYZ, but also - of DBZ, and at least he (Soen) used to be the main figure in the Founders Hall at DBZ when I was there. On the other hand; it was E.S. that - with his sangha and supporters - did the work establishing DBZ, and he was the first abbot. Anyway; I broke with E.S. so I am 'out of the picture' and don't know much about what is going on there.

Abbot of Egely Monastery - TaikyoJi in Denmark. Head Teacher of Rinzai Zen Buddhist Society (Denmark). Transmitted Dharma Heir of Eido Shimano. Member of American Zen Teachers Association

<http://www.taikyoji.dk>

Denko

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by simpleton on Thu Nov 25, 2010 7:16 pm

Christopher wrote:

Nonin wrote:

Eido Shimano transmitted a handful of teachers, and they will carry on the lineage, whatever that may be. They are all {...} full members of the American Zen Teachers' Association.

It seems to me that this statement says more about the AZTA's lack of discernment than the supposed legitimacy of any Shimano successors.

As I stated in my letter to the ZSS Board, his successors by definition studied with him very closely over many years. In that time they either saw what he is and accepted it, or they didn't even notice it in the first place. Both scenarios are depressing, so for me that lineage is pretty much dead, regardless of what the papers may say. The fact that the successors are even today continuing to celebrate Shimano as a "Founding Abbot Emeritus" or some such thing, shows just how disconnected from reality they really are.

I totally agree. Well said.
simpleton

by Shodo on Fri Nov 26, 2010 1:37 am

No, it was not unofficial. As I believe you can read in "Namu Dai Bosa" it actually happened - and in public with many witnesses including several zen masters (Roshis), who also functioned as 'gates' for Eido Shimano. In other words, several Roshis were part of this transmission ceremony.

Why Eido Shimano is not on the Ryutakuji paper is another question, but that does not disprove actual events.

Well, then I guess it all happened then, but it leaves me with an uneasy feeling in the pit of my stomach...

Obviously, Eido got Inka from Soen... but for whatever reason, it was never made "official" - (We can all pretty much assume the reasons...)

The part that I find upsetting was the revoking/invalidation of Eido's Inka in Japan... THAT I can only assume, was Soen's way of dealing with Eido's failings as a teacher - but why wouldn't they just revoke EIDO, as well as his Inka? Soen seemed perfectly happy to leave him at DaiBosatsu, free to pursue his predations for the next 20+ years, and never alerted anyone in the U.S.A. that his transmission was revoked... made invalid in his home temples in Japan. They just left Eido there, with full power and authority... it is confusing and upsetting.

If people had known that Soen revoked his status as a teacher... I wager that the sangha would NEVER of put up with Eido's shenanigans for so long..

The Dude: Yeah, well. The Dude abides.

The Stranger: The Dude abides. I don't know about you but I take comfort in that. It's good knowin' he's out there. The Dude. Takin' 'er easy for all us sinners.

Shodo

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Carol on Fri Nov 26, 2010 5:03 am

Shodo wrote:

No, it was not unofficial. As I believe you can read in "Namu Dai Bosa" it actually happened - and in public with many witnesses including several zen masters (Roshis), who also functioned as 'gates' for Eido Shimano. In other words, several Roshis were part of this transmission ceremony.

Why Eido Shimano is not on the Ryutakuji paper is another question, but that does not disprove actual events.

Well, then I guess it all happened then, but it leaves me with an uneasy feeling in the pit of my stomach...

Obviously, Eido got Inka from Soen... but for whatever reason, it was never made "official" - (We can all pretty much assume the reasons...)

The part that I find upsetting was the revoking/invalidation of Eido's Inka in Japan... THAT I can only assume, was Soen's way of dealing with Eido's failings as a teacher - but why wouldn't they just revoke EIDO, as well as his Inka? Soen seemed perfectly happy to leave him at DaiBosatsu, free to pursue his predations for the next 20+ years, and never alerted anyone in the U.S.A. that his transmission was revoked... made invalid in his home temples in Japan. They just left Eido there, with full power and authority... it is confusing and upsetting.

If people had known that Soen revoked his status as a teacher... I wager that the sangha would NEVER of put up with Eido's shenanigans for so long..

Yes, it is confusing ... that's why I said that a teacher's conduct is more important to me than his/her lineage. That's not to say that lineage is unimportant. I do think it is important to have received training in a tradition and be "authorized" by a teacher to teach in that tradition. But I don't think it is a guarantee that the teacher will live up to the tradition that has been passed down to him/her. On the other hand, I believe there have been truly great teachers who have emerged after a lineage declined for awhile. I believe the Dharma is there, always, even though imperfect vessels have handed it down through the ages.

I study with a Diamond Sangha teacher who broke with his teacher after receiving inka, and his teacher receive inka from Robert Aitken Roshi but later broke with him. I also understand that Aitken Roshi broke with Yasutani Roshi after receiving inka from him. It's very interesting, really. Sometimes the student greatly surpasses the teacher. Sometimes the student disappoints or fails as a teacher ... but the Dharma is transmitted anyway and blossoms again and again in new generations.

This solitary brightness hears, understands and teaches the Dharma. ~Linji

Carol

Global Moderator

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Denko on Fri Nov 26, 2010 7:39 am

Shodo wrote:

Obviously, Eido got Inka from Soen... but for whatever reason, it was never made "official" - (We can all pretty much assume the reasons...)

The part that I find upsetting was the revoking/invalidation of Eido's Inka in Japan...

I do not understand your "official". It was an official ceremony where the traditional "official" documents (etc.) were handed over.

Also: I must have missed something. Where & when was it ever revoked? Such a thing is not possible (at least within Rinzai) as far as I understand.

Besides: I am not here as a defender of E.S. I don't like him either (as a person, human being, buddhist). I am merely stating some reasonably clear facts.
Abbot of Egely Monastery - TaikyoJi in Denmark. Head Teacher of Rinzai Zen Buddhist Society (Denmark). Transmitted Dharma Heir of Eido Shimano. Member of American Zen Teachers Association

<http://www.taikyoji.dk>

Denko

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Christopher on Fri Nov 26, 2010 12:23 pm

Carol wrote:

I believe the Dharma is there, always, even though imperfect vessels have handed it down

No need to "believe", Carol. How could it ever be otherwise?

Though I admit that when I first learned of the scandal, I too was enraged at Soen Roshi for having let Shimano even implicitly continue to be associated with the good name of Ryutakuji. In the meantime, I understand how silly that feeling was. Ultimately nobody can "tarnish" the dharma, no matter how many people may be fooled. And besides, the

irony is that Shimano himself officially severed all ties to Japanese Zen back in the eighties.

Christopher

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Shodo on Fri Nov 26, 2010 6:17 pm

I do not understand your "official". It was an official ceremony where the traditional "official" documents (etc.) were handed over.

Well something happened because Eido is not on the lineage chart as an heir of Soen Roshi in Ryutaku-ji OR Daitoku-ji - whatever you wish to call it really, I call it an unofficial transmission. If it was official, Eido's name would be on the lists.

Also: I must have missed something. Where & when was it ever revoked? Such a thing is not possible (at least within Rinzai) as far as I understand.

Then why isn't Eido on any of the lineage charts?

The Japanese follow an incredible degree of form when it comes to these things... Yes, he got inka here at DaiBosatsu, he got papers, he was made "official" here...

But in Japan something important didn't take place...

It's probably something like the Soto school, where after doing dharma combat (hossenshiki), the student has 20 years of time to receive the dharma (shiho) from his teacher. Usually, it takes less, but there are also monks who lose their status as registered Soto-shu monks because they fail to do shiho, (but if you ordain after the age of 40 and do not take this step within the next 10 years, Soto-shu will erase your name from its register as well.)

If a student doesn't receive shiho within these time periods then their name is taken off the lists in Japan and "officially" you are no longer even considered a monk - but nobody is going to come over to the states and take away your kesa and force you to grow your hair. You won't even get a phone call...

Let me just say here - I think these "rumors" have been circulating for a long time, and they were prevalent enough that Aitken went to Japan to investigate them.

I should also say, that I believe what Aitken Roshi found and recorded.

Rinzai transmission has 4 parts:

- 1) Transmission documents... (Eido has this)
- 2) A public ceremony... (Eido did this)
- 3) A registration of the transmission at the home temple Ryutaku-ji (Didn't happen)

4) An announcement of the transmission at the home temple and through established channels in the Rinzai sect (Didn't happen)

I have no reason to think that Aitken was lying about this or about the events that happened in Japan at Soen's funeral at Ryutaku-ji... where he was told that Eido was led to the section of former monks and NOT the section for Roshis and Dharma heirs. Aitken was told that this was a clear signal that Eido was not considered a roshi/heir by his Japanese colleagues.

Something didn't happen in Japan to complete Eido's transmission to make it....

"Official"... whatever you want to call it really...

Last edited by Shodo on Fri Nov 26, 2010 7:13 pm, edited 2 times in total.

The Dude: Yeah, well. The Dude abides.

The Stranger: The Dude abides. I don't know about you but I take comfort in that. It's good knowin' he's out there. The Dude. Takin' 'er easy for all us sinners.

Shodo

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Shodo on Fri Nov 26, 2010 6:46 pm

Though I admit that when I first learned of the scandal, I too was enraged at Soen Roshi for having let Shimano even implicitly continue to be associated with the good name of Ryutakuji. In the meantime, I understand how silly that feeling was. Ultimately nobody can "tarnish" the dharma, no matter how many people may be fooled. And besides, the irony is that Shimano himself officially severed all ties to Japanese Zen back in the eighties.

Maybe we are seeing the reason WHY he severed all ties to Japanese Zen...

The Dude: Yeah, well. The Dude abides.

The Stranger: The Dude abides. I don't know about you but I take comfort in that. It's good knowin' he's out there. The Dude. Takin' 'er easy for all us sinners.

Shodo

by Nonin on Fri Nov 26, 2010 8:41 pm

It's pretty clear that Eido Shimano received inka from Soen Nakagawa and was recognized as his dharma heir. It's also clear to the Zen community at large that Eido Shimano's dharma heirs that received inka from him were fully transmitted by him.

All the rest of the speculation on this thread is just that -- merely speculation. No one here knows what the final relationship was between Soen and Eido, and as Denko has said, whatever it was, it's not possible in Rinzai Zen Buddhism to revoke an inka once it has been fully given. No one here also knows what Eido Shimano's relationship was to the powers that be in Japan, yet some people here continue to speculate about it and offer their opinions as if they were absolute truth.

I can fully understand why people (including me) are glad to see Eido Shimano no longer function as abbot of ZSS, but I don't understand the venom behind trying to convince people that he never received inka when he did. I also don't understand the venom behind trying to discredit his dharma heirs, whose legitimacy has never been questioned by their peers and by the Zen Buddhist community at large.

A couple of Eido Shimano's dharma heirs and the rest of the current board of ZSS are engaged in righting the organization through revamping it's by-laws and re-writing it's ethical policies. They are also engaged in instituting a process by which the hurt created by Eido's transgressions may be healed. They deserve everyone's support in this effort, and they have sought the advice and received the support of many Zen Buddhist teachers from a variety of lineages and traditions.

Calling Eido Shimano nasty names and continuing to snipe at him and especially at his lineage as embodied by his dharma heirs may make those doing this feel good, but trying to discredit worthy people by considering them unworthy because of the bad behavior of their dharma father is character assassination and is downright reprehensible.

Hands palm-to-palm,

Nonin

Soto Zen Buddhist Priest. Transmitted Dharma Heir of Dainin Katagiri Roshi.

Abbot and Head Teacher, Nebraska Zen Center / Heartland Temple, Omaha, Nebraska, USA

<http://www.prairiewindzen.org>

Nonin

Global Moderator

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Shodo on Fri Nov 26, 2010 8:43 pm

Nonin wrote:
Denko,

As an aside, in Soto Zen we are given lineage papers (ketchimyaku) when dharma transmission is completed. Are there similar papers given in Rinzai Zen when disciples are authorized to teach (I don't know what the term is for this) or when inka (the seal of dharma transmission) is given? Or, is the scroll the only official acknowledgment of inka?

Hands palm-to-palm,

Nonin

As a technical aside... there is more than lineage papers given in Soto-shu zen transmission.

They are called sanmotsu in Japanese, which literally means "the three things" (funny because the 4th is "secret").... These are:

- a) Shisho (the scripture of transmission, the names of the ancestors arranged in a circle - the dharma has passed on from to Shakyamuni to yourself, and now you give it back to Shakyamuni.
- b) Daiji (the great matter, a cryptic symbolization of the content of the teaching. Again, there is a small extra sheet of paper that explains about the meaning of the symbols.)
- c) Kechimyaku (the blood lineage, looks quite similar to the blood line transmission that you already wrote at the time of ordination)
- d) Hisho (the secret document, which is encoded, but the code for deciphering is on the same paper, so once you hold it in your hands it is not so "secret" anymore.)

Each of the documents comes in a separate envelope. They are signed by both teacher and student and stamped by the teacher in a similar manner like the kechimyaku at the time of ordination.

The Dude: Yeah, well. The Dude abides.

The Stranger: The Dude abides. I don't know about you but I take comfort in that. It's good knowin' he's out there. The Dude. Takin' 'er easy for all us sinners.

Shodo

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Shodo on Fri Nov 26, 2010 8:54 pm

Calling Eido Shimano nasty names and continuing to snipe at him and especially at his lineage as embodied by his dharma heirs may make those doing this feel good, but trying

to discredit worthy people by considering them unworthy because of the bad behavior of their dharma father is character assassination and is downright reprehensible.

I just want to say, that I am trying not to make this a vitriolic discussion, nor am I trying to insinuate that Eido's heirs are illegitimate...

As for Eido's status as an heir of Soen in Japan... can't somebody give Ryutaku-ji a call and find this stuff out?

I would be the first to acknowledge that I would rather base my opinions in fact and not rumor.

The Dude: Yeah, well. The Dude abides.

The Stranger: The Dude abides. I don't know about you but I take comfort in that. It's good knowin' he's out there. The Dude. Takin' 'er easy for all us sinners.

Shodo

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Nonin on Fri Nov 26, 2010 8:58 pm

Shodo,

You are mistaken about the content of the daiji, ketchimyaku, and shisho given at the dharma transmission ceremony in Soto Zen Buddhism. All three documents represent interpretations of what dharma transmission means through different manifestation of the lineage chart. Also, my shisho is not "encoded." It's in straightforward Japanese, as are the other documents. Because I am a calligrapher, I was able to copy my master's documents in kanji. At this point in time, the documents are frequently presented in Roman writing and partly in English so that those who cannot write kanji are able to copy them.

Denko's answer to my question said that he, too, received transmission papers, but I don't know how similar they are to mine. The biggest difference is that Denko and all others who receive inka are given a calligraphy scroll of the same kind given to Eido Shimano by Soen Nakagawa.

These papers are important, for somewhere down the line, those who have received them are able to show them and shut up anyone who questions the authenticity of their transmission.

Hands palm-to-palm,

Nonin

Soto Zen Buddhist Priest. Transmitted Dharma Heir of Dainin Katagiri Roshi.

Abbot and Head Teacher, Nebraska Zen Center / Heartland Temple, Omaha, Nebraska, USA

<http://www.prairiewindzen.org>

Nonin
Global Moderator

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Shodo on Fri Nov 26, 2010 9:07 pm

You are mistaken about the content of the daiji, ketchimyaku, and shisho given at the dharma transmission ceremony in Soto Zen Buddhism. All three documents represent interpretations of what dharma transmission means through different manifestation of the lineage chart. Also, my shisho is not "encoded." It's in straightforward Japanese, as are the other documents. Because I am a calligrapher, I was able to copy my master's documents in kanji. At this point in time, the documents are frequently presented in Roman writing and partly in English so that those who cannot write kanji are able to copy them.

You are probably correct, I am neither an expert nor a monk.
I just got it from Antai-ji's website in Japan.

What does it take to become a full-fledged Soto-shu priest and is it really worth the whole deal?

(Part 2: Ten points to keep in mind about dharma transmission)

<http://antaiji.dogen-zen.de/eng/201005.shtml>

...the differences were probably particular to Kodo Sawaki.

Further down the page it says:

"Dharma transmission can never be erased. Married persons can get a divorce, but the fact of child birth can never be denied. Once you have transmitted the dharma, you can not claim it back. Once you have received it, you can not return it. But even stupid things like this can sometimes be seen in the "Zen" world."

I just wish somebody could find out, once and for all, what the heck happened in Japan to not include Eido in the lineage charts at Ryutaku-ji and Daitoku-ji...

The Dude: Yeah, well. The Dude abides.

The Stranger: The Dude abides. I don't know about you but I take comfort in that. It's good knowin' he's out there. The Dude. Takin' 'er easy for all us sinners.

Shodo

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Nonin on Fri Nov 26, 2010 9:08 pm

Shodo wrote:

Calling Eido Shimano nasty names and continuing to snipe at him and especially at his lineage as embodied by his dharma heirs may make those doing this feel good, but trying to discredit worthy people by considering them unworthy because of the bad behavior of their dharma father is character assassination and is downright reprehensible.

I just want to say, that I am trying not to make this a vitriolic discussion, nor am I trying to insinuate that Eido's heirs are illegitimate...

As for Eido's status as an heir of Soen in Japan... can't somebody give Ryutaku-ji a call and find this stuff out?

I would be the first to acknowledge that I would rather base my opinions in fact and not rumor.

Whatever Ryutaku-ji says will not change the fact that Soen gave inka to Eido. The inka scroll confirms that, as does the dharma transmission ceremony that was well-witnessed. Whatever Ryutaku-ji says will not change the fact that Eido gave inka to his dharma heirs. Their scrolls and the papers they have confirm this.

Also, I attended Roko Chayat's dharma transmission ceremony, so I am a witness to the fact that she received inka from Eido Shimano. Historically, dharma transmission ceremonies were done privately at night, but these days, many of us are doing them publicly. I did both with my dharma heir, Rev. Kyoki Roberts. I did the traditional master/disciple ceremony with a couple of attendants privately, and then I did a public ceremony with many witnesses, including a couple of teachers, because I wanted the Zen Buddhist community at large to know that the transmission had been completed so that no one could question Kyoki's legitimacy in the future, as some people are wont to do for a variety of reasons, as is evidenced by this thread.

Hands palm-to-palm,

Nonin

Soto Zen Buddhist Priest. Transmitted Dharma Heir of Dainin Katagiri Roshi.

Abbot and Head Teacher, Nebraska Zen Center / Heartland Temple, Omaha, Nebraska,
USA

<http://www.prairiewindzen.org>

Nonin
Global Moderator

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Jok_Hae on Fri Nov 26, 2010 9:12 pm

Shodo wrote:

Calling Eido Shimano nasty names and continuing to snipe at him and especially at his lineage as embodied by his dharma heirs may make those doing this feel good, but trying to discredit worthy people by considering them unworthy because of the bad behavior of their dharma father is character assassination and is downright reprehensible.

I just want to say, that I am trying not to make this a vitriolic discussion, nor am I trying to insinuate that Eido's heirs are illegitimate...

As for Eido's status as an heir of Soen in Japan... can't somebody give Ryutaku-ji a call and find this stuff out?

I would be the first to acknowledge that I would rather base my opinions in fact and not rumor.

Then why bring it up? Do you practice with one of his heirs? If not, then this whole discussion is just worthless gossiping.

Where do thoughts come from?

Kwan Um School of Zen New Haven Zen Center

Jok_Hae

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Shodo on Fri Nov 26, 2010 9:25 pm

Whatever Ryutaku-ji says will not change the fact that Soen gave inka to Eido. The inka scroll confirms that, as does the dharma transmission ceremony that was well-witnessed. Whatever Ryutaku-ji says will not change the fact that Eido gave inka to his dharma heirs. Their scrolls and the papers they have confirm this.

I understand.

But it is neither gossip or slander to want to know WHY Eido is not listed as an heir of Soen at his own home temple in Japan - when he obviously went through the ceremony and received the inka papers here...

Whatever Ryutaku-ji says will not change the fact these things happened - but I still feel that it is important to know.

Doesn't anyone else feel this way?

The Dude: Yeah, well. The Dude abides.

The Stranger: The Dude abides. I don't know about you but I take comfort in that. It's good knowin' he's out there. The Dude. Takin' 'er easy for all us sinners.

Shodo

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Nonin on Fri Nov 26, 2010 9:28 pm

Shodo wrote:

Then why bring it up? Do you practice with one of his heirs? If not, then this whole discussion is just worthless gossiping.

Because it's WEIRD...!

It is not gossip when you are trying to figure out the WHY of something...

Fact - Eido got transmission from Soen.

Fact - Eido is not on the lineage lists of either Ryutaku-ji OR Daitoku-ji as an heir of Soen Nakagawa.

I want to know WHY that is.

The problem is that by the way the moderators are starting to sound, this thread is getting ready to be locked... I will acknowledge that this is the sort of conversation that has a lot of potential to upset people, but I think that knowing what happened is very important.

Then either call Ryutaku-ji or go there and find out. It's clear that no one here can answer your query, so why continue to press it here?

Hands palm-to-palm,

Nonin

Soto Zen Buddhist Priest. Transmitted Dharma Heir of Dainin Katagiri Roshi.

Abbot and Head Teacher, Nebraska Zen Center / Heartland Temple, Omaha, Nebraska, USA

<http://www.prairiewindzen.org>

Nonin

Global Moderator

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Shodo on Fri Nov 26, 2010 9:32 pm

Then either call Ryutaku-ji or go there and find out. It's clear that no one here can answer your query, so why continue to press it here?

Why in the world would they even take the time to talk to me...?

How about this - Denko, as Shimano's Dharma heir, could you please call Ryutaku-ji and settle this matter?

Nonin, please don't lock this thread until we get a response from Denko.

The Dude: Yeah, well. The Dude abides.

The Stranger: The Dude abides. I don't know about you but I take comfort in that. It's good knowin' he's out there. The Dude. Takin' 'er easy for all us sinners.

Shodo

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Anders Honore on Sat Nov 27, 2010 12:48 am

if it's important to you, the least you could do is try and call them, before throwing in the towel and making demands of others here. if you don't care enough to do that, how can you in good conscience justify your repeated speculation as anything other than stirring the pot?

"Even if my body should be burnt to death

In the fires of hell,

I would endure it for myriad lifetimes
As your companion in practise."

--- Avatamsaka Sutra

Anders Honore

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Shodo on Sat Nov 27, 2010 1:35 am

Anders Honore wrote:
if it's important to you, the least you could do is try and call them, before throwing in the towel and making demands of others here. if you don't care enough to do that, how can you in good conscience justify your repeated speculation as anything other than stirring the pot?

I don't speak Japanese, I am not a monk with any sort of connection there and they have no clue about me...

...but if you know their email or fax number I would be happy to do it.

The Dude: Yeah, well. The Dude abides.

The Stranger: The Dude abides. I don't know about you but I take comfort in that. It's good knowin' he's out there. The Dude. Takin' 'er easy for all us sinners.

Shodo

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Nonin on Sat Nov 27, 2010 1:39 am

Look it up on the net (try Google).

Hands palm-to-palm,

Nonin
Soto Zen Buddhist Priest. Transmitted Dharma Heir of Dainin Katagiri Roshi.

Abbot and Head Teacher, Nebraska Zen Center / Heartland Temple, Omaha, Nebraska,
USA

<http://www.prairiewindzen.org>

Nonin

Global Moderator

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Shodo on Sat Nov 27, 2010 1:56 am

I cannot find anything but an address and a telephone number.

I would rather not call (due to the language barrier, as well as the cultural barrier), but I will write them unless anyone with a better contact list than just me and my google...

If anyone out there knows an email or fax number just PM it to me.

The Dude: Yeah, well. The Dude abides.

The Stranger: The Dude abides. I don't know about you but I take comfort in that. It's good knowin' he's out there. The Dude. Takin' 'er easy for all us sinners.

Shodo

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Christopher on Sat Nov 27, 2010 12:45 pm

Shodo wrote:

I cannot find anything but an address and a telephone number.

Dear friend,

As far as I know those are the only two ways to get in touch with Ryutaku-ji. Writing might be the best bet, because then the language barrier won't be a problem. As far as I know, the current abbot Eizan Goto understands English.

For what it's worth, I also find it strange that Eido isn't listed. It doesn't bother me enough to call Ryutaku-ji about it, but that certainly doesn't make it an inappropriate topic of discussion. And I really don't get the allegation why YOU personally would have to be practicing under one of Shimano's successors in order to have a right to bring this up.

Nonin wrote:

I also don't understand the venom behind trying to discredit his dharma heirs, whose legitimacy has never been questioned by their peers and by the Zen Buddhist community at large. {...} trying to discredit worthy people by considering them unworthy because of the bad behavior of their dharma father is character assassination and is downright reprehensible.

Hi Nonin,

As I stated above, the fact that their legitimacy has never been questioned by the Zen Buddhist community is, unfortunately, hardly an argument. Indeed, Shimano himself was celebrated by the entire world for forty years. On the other hand, my simple de facto reasoning that Shimano's heirs either knew the truth about him and accepted it, or they didn't notice it at all, has yet to be refuted.

But I take it that drawing the conclusion not to seek spiritual guidance from such people constitutes "character assassination."

Christopher

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Jok_Hae on Sat Nov 27, 2010 1:30 pm

Christopher wrote:

Shodo wrote:

I cannot find anything but an address and a telephone number.

Dear friend,

As far as I know those are the only two ways to get in touch with Ryutaku-ji. Writing might be the best bet, because then the language barrier won't be a problem. As far as I know, the current abbot Eizan Goto understands English.

For what it's worth, I also find it strange that Eido isn't listed. It doesn't bother me enough to call Ryutaku-ji about it, but that certainly doesn't make it an inappropriate topic of discussion. And I really don't get the allegation why YOU personally would have to be practicing under one of Shimano's successors in order to have a right to bring this up.

Nonin wrote:

I also don't understand the venom behind trying to discredit his dharma heirs, whose legitimacy has never been questioned by their peers and by the Zen Buddhist community at large. {...} trying to discredit worthy people by considering them unworthy because of the bad behavior of their dharma father is character assassination and is downright reprehensible.

Hi Nonin,

As I stated above, the fact that their legitimacy has never been questioned by the Zen Buddhist community is, unfortunately, hardly an argument. Indeed, Shimano himself was celebrated by the entire world for forty years. On the other hand, my simple de facto reasoning that Shimano's heirs either knew the truth about him and accepted it, or they didn't notice it at all, has yet to be refuted.

rth

But I take it that drawing the conclusion not to seek spiritual guidance from such people constitutes "character assassination."

So, what's the endgame? Should Shimano be drawn and quartered and his heirs be chased from their Dharma rooms? The North Korean government has a wonderful tradition when someone defects from their country. They either execute the defectors family outright or send them to "reeducation" camps where they live very short and painful lives. Maybe the Zen Community could set something like that up. Would that satisfy you?

Teaching lineages come and go. It is hard to understand why someone would practice in this one, but that is an individual choice, not the Zen community's (whatever that is). Discussing this with only a cursory knowledge of the facts is, imho, inappropriate. Perhaps one day you will feel that you have received your pound of flesh, but what then?

Hopefully, the victims and yes, the perpetrator, can come to a place of peace after all this. A truly sad situation.
Where do thoughts come from?

Kwan Um School of Zen New Haven Zen Center

Jok_Hae

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by partofit22 on Sat Nov 27, 2010 4:15 pm

it's not uncommon for people to want more -- of anything-
partofit22

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Jok_Hae on Sat Nov 27, 2010 4:30 pm

My apologies to everyone for reacting so strongly...I don't understand the attack dog mentality very well.
Where do thoughts come from?

Kwan Um School of Zen New Haven Zen Center

Jok_Hae

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by partofit22 on Sat Nov 27, 2010 5:03 pm

reinforcement, keith-

attack dogs can do this too ...
partofit22

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Jok_Hae on Sat Nov 27, 2010 5:34 pm

partofit22 wrote:
reinforcement, keith-

attack dogs can do this too ...

Believe me, I understand the anger and the need for justice, especially from folks who were victimized by this person. I can't imagine what it must be like to have one's trust betrayed like that.

But now we have to wipe out the whole lineage? When does the vengeance end and the healing begin? If someone thinks the lineage is invalid, fine. It's a personal opinion. But suggesting that the Zen community is somehow responsible for tearing this thing down is just over the top, imho. If someone hangs a "Zen teacher" sign on the front door, it is up to the prospective student to decide if the teacher is a worthy one, not the Zen community.

K
Where do thoughts come from?

Kwan Um School of Zen New Haven Zen Center

Jok_Hae

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Denko on Sat Nov 27, 2010 6:09 pm

Shodo wrote:
How about this - Denko, as Shimano's Dharma heir, could you please call Ryutaku-ji and settle this matter?

Nonin, please don't lock this thread until we get a response from Denko.

Ryutakuji's business is none of my concern & I have no interest in going around settling matters for others. I am satisfied with fact of the public (official) dharma transmission ceremony that took place and the various proofs I have seen myself.
Abbot of Egely Monastery - TaikyoJi in Denmark. Head Teacher of Rinzai Zen Buddhist Society (Denmark). Transmitted Dharma Heir of Eido Shimano. Member of American Zen Teachers Association

<http://www.taikyoji.dk>

Denko

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Christopher on Sat Nov 27, 2010 6:12 pm

Jok_Hae wrote:

suggesting that the Zen community is somehow responsible for tearing this thing down is just over the top

Dear Keith,

I wasn't suggesting that, and I don't even necessarily disagree with you. What I did suggest, is the fact that the Zen community has not questioned the legitimacy of certain teachers is hardly an argument proving they are any good. On the contrary, this whole Shimano scandal actually tends to show the opposite, i.e. that the Zen establishment clearly has a less-than-neutral interest in preserving itself.

But anyways, of course each student is ultimately responsible for choosing their own teacher. I certainly don't claim any authority in this regard (unlike certain others, I might add!) All I am doing is pointing out a very obvious and fundamental problem with anyone who claims to have been properly trained in Zen by Shimano. How exactly is that an inappropriate topic on a Zen Buddhist bulletin board?

By the way, you ask when the healing is supposed to begin. I wonder too, especially when I get emails like this from the Zen Studies Society (dated November 20, 2010):

After fifty years of unparalleled dedication to the transmission of Rinzai Zen Buddhism to America, Muishitsu Eido Sotai Shimano Roshi will retire on the last day of Rohatsu Sesshin, December 8, 2010, becoming the Founding Abbot of the Zen Studies Society's temples, Dai Bosatsu Zendo Kongo-ji and New York Zendo Shobo-ji.

Eido Roshi's unsparing efforts to root in American soil the legacy of our rich Dharma lineage from Hakuin Ekaku Zenji to Gempo Yamamoto Roshi and Soen Nakagawa

Roshi, from Soyen Shaku Roshi to D.T. Suzuki and Nyogen Senzaki, have brought us to this momentous time of growth and flowering.

Christopher

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Carol on Sat Nov 27, 2010 6:52 pm

Moderator's Note: Please review our Terms of Service here about disruptive posting. Also please READ this article on Meta-Discussion, which is a kind of disruptive posting. Please take some time to digest and think about it.

I've removed a couple of clearly meta-discussion posts. But you all got ahead of me over the holiday, so I've left others because it's just too much to sort it all out.

In particular, please avoid speculating about or attacking other board members' perspectives and/or motives.

Thank you.
This solitary brightness hears, understands and teaches the Dharma. ~Linji

Carol
Global Moderator

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Jok_Hae on Sat Nov 27, 2010 7:19 pm

Christopher wrote:
Jok_Hae wrote:
suggesting that the Zen community is somehow responsible for tearing this thing down is just over the top

Dear Keith,

I wasn't suggesting that, and I don't even necessarily disagree with you. What I did suggest, is the fact that the Zen community has not questioned the legitimacy of certain teachers is hardly an argument proving they are any good. On the contrary, this whole Shimano scandal actually tends to show the opposite, i.e. that the Zen establishment clearly has a less-than-neutral interest in preserving itself.

But anyways, of course each student is ultimately responsible for choosing their own teacher. I certainly don't claim any authority in this regard (unlike certain others, I might

add!) All I am doing is pointing out a very obvious and fundamental problem with anyone who claims to have been properly trained in Zen by Shimano. How exactly is that an inappropriate topic on a Zen Buddhist bulletin board?

By the way, you ask when the healing is supposed to begin. I wonder too, especially when I get emails like this from the Zen Studies Society (dated November 20, 2010):

After fifty years of unparalleled dedication to the transmission of Rinzai Zen Buddhism to America, Muishitsu Eido Sotai Shimano Roshi will retire on the last day of Rohatsu Sesshin, December 8, 2010, becoming the Founding Abbot of the Zen Studies Society's temples, Dai Bosatsu Zendo Kongo-ji and New York Zendo Shobo-ji.

Eido Roshi's unsparing efforts to root in American soil the legacy of our rich Dharma lineage from Hakuin Ekaku Zenji to Gempo Yamamoto Roshi and Soen Nakagawa Roshi, from Soyen Shaku Roshi to D.T. Suzuki and Nyogen Senzaki, have brought us to this momentous time of growth and flowering.

Hi Chris,

Just a couple points and I will back off. One, I don't believe in a monolithic Zen Community any more than I believe in "Western" Zen or any other terms which enable folks to make broad and sweeping generalizations. I am not sure who is supposed to be doing the questioning that is being suggested. Secondly, the thread is titled "Modern Zen Teachers", so you are correct (as is Shodo) when you suggest that this topic is fair game for discussion. It does strike me as salacious, blog world stuff to me, but that is my problem. Anyway, I stand corrected and am free to ignore the thread.

Finally, you finished yet another mystifying letter from the ZSS. I am amazed they are still cranking out stuff like this. So, I suppose you are right, the wounds will continue to be ripped open for the time being.

Good luck and thanks for practicing,

Keith

Where do thoughts come from?

Kwan Um School of Zen New Haven Zen Center

Jok_Hae

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Shodo on Sat Nov 27, 2010 10:32 pm

After fifty years of unparalleled dedication to the transmission of Rinzai Zen Buddhism to America, Muishitsu Eido Sotai Shimano Roshi will retire on the last day of Rohatsu Sesshin, December 8, 2010, becoming the Founding Abbot of the Zen Studies Society's temples, Dai Bosatsu Zendo Kongo-ji and New York Zendo Shobo-ji.

Eido Roshi's unsparing efforts to root in American soil the legacy of our rich Dharma lineage from Hakuin Ekaku Zenji to Gempo Yamamoto Roshi and Soen Nakagawa Roshi, from Soyen Shaku Roshi to D.T. Suzuki and Nyogen Senzaki, have brought us to this momentous time of growth and flowering.

This is why I am asking this question.

This revisionist history... needs to be investigated.

The above is a claim to lineage that is only going one way, from Eido to Soen... but is not being recognized by Soen and Eido's Japanese peers as shown by the lineage charts - this needs to be asked for no other reason that to understand the discrepancy.

I must admit, nothing.... and I mean NOTHING has made me doubt my own motivations for even asking this question more than it posting on these forums.

Nobody seems to want to know... and I am just a gossipy a-hole for even asking.

I am going to write up a letter, and send it to Ryutaku-ji on Monday.

I will post what I wrote to them, and IF I get a response, I will post it here.

The Dude: Yeah, well. The Dude abides.

The Stranger: The Dude abides. I don't know about you but I take comfort in that. It's good knowin' he's out there. The Dude. Takin' 'er easy for all us sinners.

Shodo

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Jok_Hae on Sat Nov 27, 2010 11:00 pm

Shodo wrote:

After fifty years of unparalleled dedication to the transmission of Rinzai Zen Buddhism to America, Muishitsu Eido Sotai Shimano Roshi will retire on the last day of Rohatsu Sesshin, December 8, 2010, becoming the Founding Abbot of the Zen Studies Society's temples, Dai Bosatsu Zendo Kongo-ji and New York Zendo Shobo-ji.

Eido Roshi's unsparing efforts to root in American soil the legacy of our rich Dharma lineage from Hakuin Ekaku Zenji to Gempo Yamamoto Roshi and Soen Nakagawa Roshi, from Soyen Shaku Roshi to D.T. Suzuki and Nyogen Senzaki, have brought us to this momentous time of growth and flowering.

This is why I am asking this question.

This revisionist history... needs to be investigated.

The above is a claim to lineage that is only going one way, from Eido to Soen... but is not being recognized by Soen and Eido's Japanese peers as shown by the lineage charts - this needs to be asked for no other reason that to understand the discrepancy.

I must admit, nothing.... and I mean NOTHING has made me doubt my own motivations for even asking this question more than it posting on these forums.

Nobody seems to want to know... and I am just a gossipy a-hole for even asking.

I am going to write up a letter, and send it to Ryutaku-ji on Monday.

I will post what I wrote to them, and IF I get a response, I will post it here.

Good luck in your search.

Where do thoughts come from?

Kwan Um School of Zen New Haven Zen Center

Jok_Hae

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by partofit22 on Sun Nov 28, 2010 2:06 pm

Shodo wrote:

Nobody seems to want to know... and I am just a gossipy a-hole for even asking.

I am going to write up a letter, and send it to Ryutaku-ji on Monday.

I will post what I wrote to them, and IF I get a response, I will post it here.

shodo, if you think the lineage is questionable, you think it's questionable- if you want to research it, research it- if you care to share your findings, so be it- how and where is up to you- the tone of the OP was inquisitive- why not just follow through, yourself, with that tone intact instead of pulling a switcheroo and trying to recruit others to do it for you?
partofit22

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Shodo on Sun Nov 28, 2010 4:46 pm

shodo, if you think the lineage is questionable, you think it's questionable- if you want to research it, research it- if you care to share your findings, so be it- how and where is up to you- the tone of the OP was inquisitive- why not just follow through, yourself, with that tone intact instead of pulling a switcheroo and trying to recruit others to do it for you?

I am doing just that... I thought that was fairly clear from what you quoted.

Nobody seems to want to know... and I am just a gossipy a-hole for even asking.

I said this because that is how I felt after the discussion got going. What I had found was "interesting" and "perplexing", but as the discussion progressed it became a "why are you asking/you are just being gossipy and trying to stir up negative stuff." I thought that people would really want to know WHY this is... especially since Eido Roshi has been embroiled in scandal more often than not over the past 40 years.

But I don't want to get into a discussion over the discussion... so I will just leave it at that.

The Dude: Yeah, well. The Dude abides.

The Stranger: The Dude abides. I don't know about you but I take comfort in that. It's good knowin' he's out there. The Dude. Takin' 'er easy for all us sinners.

Shodo

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Shodo on Sun Nov 28, 2010 6:25 pm

Dear Keith,

I wasn't suggesting that, and I don't even necessarily disagree with you. What I did suggest, is the fact that the Zen community has not questioned the legitimacy of certain teachers is hardly an argument proving they are any good. On the contrary, this whole Shimano scandal actually tends to show the opposite, i.e. that the Zen establishment clearly has a less-than-neutral interest in preserving itself.

But anyways, of course each student is ultimately responsible for choosing their own teacher. I certainly don't claim any authority in this regard (unlike certain others, I might add!) All I am doing is pointing out a very obvious and fundamental problem with anyone who claims to have been properly trained in Zen by Shimano. How exactly is that an inappropriate topic on a Zen Buddhist bulletin board?

I just found this article, and at many points it seems to address what you are asking.

<http://rzc.org/drupal/sites/default/files/teachers.pdf>

It is an excellent article.

The Dude: Yeah, well. The Dude abides.

The Stranger: The Dude abides. I don't know about you but I take comfort in that. It's good knowin' he's out there. The Dude. Takin' 'er easy for all us sinners.

Shodo

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by **Jok_Hae on Sun Nov 28, 2010 7:03 pm**

Shodo wrote:

Dear Keith,

I wasn't suggesting that, and I don't even necessarily disagree with you. What I did suggest, is the fact that the Zen community has not questioned the legitimacy of certain teachers is hardly an argument proving they are any good. On the contrary, this whole Shimano scandal actually tends to show the opposite, i.e. that the Zen establishment clearly has a less-than-neutral interest in preserving itself.

But anyways, of course each student is ultimately responsible for choosing their own teacher. I certainly don't claim any authority in this regard (unlike certain others, I might add!) All I am doing is pointing out a very obvious and fundamental problem with anyone who claims to have been properly trained in Zen by Shimano. How exactly is that an inappropriate topic on a Zen Buddhist bulletin board?

I just found this article, and at many points it seems to address what you are asking.

<http://rzc.org/drupal/sites/default/files/teachers.pdf>

It is an excellent article.

I agree..even though I might have some minor quibbles. We discussed it here.

My point is this..suppose we as a group decide that Shimano's heirs are not legitimate and Shimano was in fact, never a Roshi to begin with (the latter point seems to have been refuted in this discussion), then what? What we think really doesn't matter.

Anyway, as has been stated, it would seem to be a fair topic for discussion.
Where do thoughts come from?

Kwan Um School of Zen New Haven Zen Center

Jok_Hae

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by chapulincolorado on Sun Nov 28, 2010 11:12 pm

Shodo wrote:

Why in the world would they even take the time to talk to me...?

How about this - Denko, as Shimano's Dharma heir, could you please call Ryutaku-ji and settle this matter?

Nonin, please don't lock this thread until we get a response from Denko.

and Denko wrote:

Ryutakuji's business is none of my concern & I have no interest in going around settling matters for others. I am satisfied with fact of the public (official) dharma transmission ceremony that took place and the various proofs I have seen myself.

Maybe this is a matter to be figured out in another venue?

"Meditation is not to get out of society, to escape from society, but to prepare for a re-entry into society."

--Thich Nhat Hanh

Flor de Nopal Sangha

chapulincolorado

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Shodo on Mon Dec 06, 2010 3:56 am

Looks like this is an issue that is on it's way to being resolved...

Rev Kobutsu Malone is already asking this question, and it is on it's way to Ryutaki-ji..

http://www.shimanoarchive.com/PDFs/2010 ... e_Goto.pdf

Go Go Kobutsu Malone!

The Dude: Yeah, well. The Dude abides.

The Stranger: The Dude abides. I don't know about you but I take comfort in that. It's good knowin' he's out there. The Dude. Takin' 'er easy for all us sinners.

Shodo

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Genjo on Sat Dec 11, 2010 10:00 pm

I too will be interested if any response is received from Japan, but regardless there should be no doubt that Soen Roshi did name Eido Roshi as a Dharma Heir. Whether or not it was recorded properly in Japan I don't know. There has been some speculation that perhaps Soen Roshi who was known to be very unhappy with Eido Roshi's sexual breaches with students did not record the event in Japan or had it removed from the record. If this speculation is true, then as far as I am concerned, bravo for him. I know when I briefly trained with Soen Roshi at Ryutaku-Ji in 1981 he told me I should check out Dai Bosatsu Zendo when I returned to the United States. He said nothing negative to me about Eido Roshi. It is also true that while I was there he refused to see Eido Roshi when he came to visit, but that was before Soen Roshi came out of one of his own self-imposed periods of seclusion during which he would see know one.

However, as we should all know, Zen transmission does not transmit anything! Transmission may be said to mean that the person who is being transmitted to is confident enough in their own true nature to know that nothing is transmitted. On the practical side, these days, in the Rinzai tradition at least, it means that the proscribed koan curriculum has been completed, and that the authorizing agent believes that the one receiving transmission has a good chance of passing the tradition on. That this ceremony happened between Soen Roshi and Eido Roshi is indisputable.

As far as this being recognized in Japan, I do offer that the official site of the Joint Council for Japanese Rinzai and Obaku Zen does list Dai Bosatsu Zendo Kongo-Ji as only one of seven listed Rinzai Zen Centers in the West. Why would Dai Bosatsu be listed if there was doubt in Japan about Eido Roshi's authenticity?

By the way, all should now know that as of December 8th, Eido Shimano Roshi is now no longer abbot of Dai Bosatsu. Shinge Roko Sherry Chayat Roshi will be installed as the second abbot of Dai Bosatsu and the Zen Studies Society on January 1st, 2011.

Genjo

Abbot of Dai Bai Zan Cho Bo Zen Ji (Chobo-Ji) temple, Seattle, USA; psychotherapist and certificated spiritual director.

<http://www.choboji.org>
Genjo

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Christopher on Sun Dec 12, 2010 12:51 pm

Genjo wrote:

By the way, all should now know that as of December 8th, Eido Shimano Roshi is now no longer abbot of Dai Bosatsu. Shinge Roko Sherry Chayat Roshi will be installed as the second abbot of Dai Bosatsu and the Zen Studies Society on January 1st, 2011.

Dear Genjo,

Thank you for the update. May I inquire what functions Mr. Shimano will retain at the ZSS? What does being a "Retired Founding Abbott" concretely entail? For example, is it true that he will indeed remain in a kind of honorary position of authority at the monastery for the next six months, teaching Ms. Chayat the ropes?

Christopher

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Nonin on Sun Dec 12, 2010 4:42 pm

Here are the two most recent updates about the current situation at Zen Studies Society, which includes the city temple (Shobo-ji) and Daibosatsu Monastery"

<http://www.daibosatsu.org/ethical.html>
[http://www.daibosatsu.org/images/update ... ectors.pdf](http://www.daibosatsu.org/images/update...ectors.pdf)

Can we please get back on topic, which is Eido Shimano's lineage.

Hands palm-to-palm,

Nonin
Soto Zen Buddhist Priest. Transmitted Dharma Heir of Dainin Katagiri Roshi.

Abbot and Head Teacher, Nebraska Zen Center / Heartland Temple, Omaha, Nebraska,
USA

<http://www.prairiewindzen.org>

Nonin

Global Moderator

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Shodo on Mon Dec 13, 2010 4:53 pm

As far as this being recognized in Japan, I do offer that the official site of the Joint Council for Japanese Rinzai and Obaku Zen does list Dai Bosatsu Zendo Kongo-Ji as only one of seven listed Rinzai Zen Centers in the West. Why would Dai Bosatsu be listed if there was doubt in Japan about Eido Roshi's authenticity?

If Eido Shimano was listed in the lineage charts at Ryutaku-ji and Daitoku-ji, there would be no doubts regarding his authenticity.

After all, these rumors have been around since the 80's when Aitken Roshi went to Japan to investigate, and are only being seriously considered these days - nobody has ever really bothered to get to the bottom of the rumors besides Aitken until now.

For all we know, the Joint Council for Japanese Rinzai and Obaku Zen may be just as in the dark as us, they may have no clue about the investigation going on... or that there is even a problem, since all mention of any scandal ever even happening has been wiped from Eido Shimano's Japanese Wikipedia pages.

Perhaps the Joint Council for Japanese Rinzai and Obaku Zen should be notified?

The Dude: Yeah, well. The Dude abides.

The Stranger: The Dude abides. I don't know about you but I take comfort in that. It's good knowin' he's out there. The Dude. Takin' 'er easy for all us sinners.

Shodo

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Nonin on Mon Dec 13, 2010 5:09 pm

Shodo,

You said:

... the Joint Council for Japanese Rinzai and Obaku Zen may be just as in the dark as us.

Who is in the dark? Eido Shimano's dharma transmission from Soen Nakagawa as Soen's dharma heir was witnessed by many people, and the papers confirming the inka are a matter of public record.

Whether Eido-roshi was registered in Japan as Soen's dharma heir, whether he was registered and then removed from the roles at Ryutaku-ji, or whether he's still registered

are matters for speculation only at this point. However, whether he was registered or not or whatever happened, the fact that he was recognized by Soen-roshi as his dharma heir is beyond question. In Rinzai Zen, once inka is given, it cannot be taken away, and the inkas given to Eido-roshi's dharma heirs can also not be taken away.

Hands palm-to-palm,

Nonin

Soto Zen Buddhist Priest. Transmitted Dharma Heir of Dainin Katagiri Roshi.

Abbot and Head Teacher, Nebraska Zen Center / Heartland Temple, Omaha, Nebraska, USA

<http://www.prairiewindzen.org>

Nonin

Global Moderator

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Shodo on Mon Dec 13, 2010 6:25 pm

Who is in the dark? Eido Shimano's dharma transmission from Soen Nakagawa as Soen's dharma heir was witnessed by many people, and the papers confirming the inka are a matter of public record.

The only paper I know of is a hanging scroll that said "Finished finished - when it is completely finished - there is nothing to finish".

Are there other papers given?

Yes, there was a public ceremony... but us westerners are woefully ignorant about what goes in to a authentic Rinzai transmission... we don't know what really goes into it. At least, all that we know seems to be coming only from a source that seems to be under question because they are not included in official lineage charts.

Whether Eido-roshi was registered in Japan as Soen's dharma heir, whether he was registered and then removed from the roles at Ryutaku-ji, or whether he's still registered are matters for speculation only at this point. However, whether he was registered or not or whatever happened, the fact that he was recognized by Soen-roshi as his dharma heir is beyond question.

In Rinzai Zen, once inka is given, it cannot be taken away, and the inkas given to Eido-roshi's dharma heirs can also not be taken away.

And yet, Eido is not on the lineage charts at his own home temple in Japan... Seems to me that something has been taken away. Like I said before, all we have to go on was a ceremony and a scroll... and unless I hear from a source other than people directly affected by what may be coming from Japan, I am going to have to respectfully doubt that any of us knows what is going on.

It is all speculation at this point, that's why I want to see what the Abbott of Ryutaku-ji has to say about it.

The Dude: Yeah, well. The Dude abides.

The Stranger: The Dude abides. I don't know about you but I take comfort in that. It's good knowin' he's out there. The Dude. Takin' 'er easy for all us sinners.

Shodo

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Nonin on Mon Dec 13, 2010 8:55 pm

Shodo,

You said:

Yes, there was a public ceremony... but us westerners are woefully ignorant about what goes in to a authentic Rinzai transmission... we don't know what really goes into it.

Speak for yourself. I attended Roko Chayat's transmission ceremony, and I and the hundred or so Westerners who were there know exactly what went into it. It was a traditional Rinzai Zen Buddhist ceremony, somewhat but not exactly like the dharma transmission public ceremonies that are done in Soto Zen Buddhism. Roko's ceremony was also written about in Hoen-ji's (Zen Center of Syracuse's) newsletter, so everyone who read it knows exactly what went into it.

Those who attended Eido Shimano's transmission ceremony knew exactly what it meant, and the papers and calligraphy confirm this. There is no question that it was authentic.

Hands palm-to-palm,

Nonin

Soto Zen Buddhist Priest. Transmitted Dharma Heir of Dainin Katagiri Roshi.

Abbot and Head Teacher, Nebraska Zen Center / Heartland Temple, Omaha, Nebraska, USA

<http://www.prairiewindzen.org>

Nonin

Global Moderator

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Christopher on Mon Dec 13, 2010 9:20 pm

Nonin wrote:
and the inkas given to Eido-roshi's dharma heirs can also not be taken away.

I read something in the archives that suggests that Eido himself isn't above casting doubt on certificates already handed out, when the heir (in this case a certain Dennis Kelly) later turns out to be less than expected.

[http://www.shimanoarchive.com/PDFs/2003 ... o_Inka.pdf](http://www.shimanoarchive.com/PDFs/2003...o_Inka.pdf)

Christopher

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Shodo on Tue Dec 14, 2010 5:20 am

Speak for yourself. I attended Roko Chayat's transmission ceremony, and I and the hundred or so Westerners who were there know exactly what went into it. It was a traditional Rinzaï Zen Buddhist ceremony, somewhat but not exactly like the dharma transmission public ceremonies that are done in Soto Zen Buddhism. Roko's ceremony was also written about in Hoen-ji's (Zen Center of Syracuse's) newsletter, so everyone who read it knows exactly what went into it.

Here is my problem...

There are only 2 traditional Rinzaï lines in the US... Eido and Joshu Sazaki. Joshu Sazaki, though he has appointed oshos, has never transmitted the dharma... and being 103 years old, will probably die without ever giving inka to anyone. That leaves Eido - and Eido is NOT on the lineage charts in Japan! So anything anyone knows about Rinzaï transmission in America stems from Soen's transmission ceremony for Eido... and I am sure that all the transmission ceremonies that Eido has ever done since then were just like the first one, complete with hanging scrolls. Just because all the ceremonies have looked like the first doesn't mean it was authentic... especially since all those ceremonies including Eido's have no recognition in Soen's home temple in Japan! The newsletter from Hoen-ji matters very little, as it is just an affiliate of DaiBosatsu. In Kobutsu's letter it is pretty evident that nobody knows about the particulars of the Rinzaï transmission... Was it something Soen made up, or is it the actual transmission ceremony?

If we hear back from Ryutaku-ji and it turns out that the ceremony/documents in official Rinzaï is different from what Soen did for Eido... Then what?

I am not a student of Eido or any of his heirs. I am just a guy who has read the archives, seen some of the people hurt by Eido, and I care about authentic transmission. You may have no problem with Eido's authenticity, but personally I would not put it past him to have lied about his status for so many years...

There is no way to ignore it - he is not on the charts. You say transmission cannot be revoked? Fine.

I still want to hear what the Abbott of Ryutaku-ji has to say about this matter.

And Christopher is correct - Eido tried to write out Dennis Junpo Kelly.

Last edited by Shodo on Tue Dec 14, 2010 7:30 am, edited 1 time in total.

The Dude: Yeah, well. The Dude abides.

The Stranger: The Dude abides. I don't know about you but I take comfort in that. It's good knowin' he's out there. The Dude. Takin' 'er easy for all us sinners.

Shodo

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Dan74 on Tue Dec 14, 2010 5:26 am

Shodo, I don't get what all this has to do with Zen.

Here we have a rogue priest who's been abusing trust for years and we are worried about the proper legalities of his dharma transmission. What am I missing?

Dan74

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...

by Shodo on Tue Dec 14, 2010 5:33 am

Shodo, I don't get what all this has to do with Zen.

Here we have a rogue priest who's been abusing trust for years and we are worried about the proper legalities of his dharma transmission. What am I missing?

Meta-discussion...

If you don't care about the questions being raised here... more power to ya.

The Dude: Yeah, well. The Dude abides.

The Stranger: The Dude abides. I don't know about you but I take comfort in that. It's good knowin' he's out there. The Dude. Takin' 'er easy for all us sinners.

Shodo

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by **Dan74 on Tue Dec 14, 2010 5:43 am**

I am sorry - it is metadiscussion, you are right.

Still I would appreciate if you could give a little of your time to elucidate for me why this is important (sorry if I am being thick).

/\
Dan74

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by **Christopher on Tue Dec 14, 2010 11:08 am**

Dan74 wrote:
elucidate for me why this is important

Hi Dan,

If I may jump in here: certain people apparently even now still consider Mr. Shimano to be a reputable teacher despite all the abuse. That is one reason to inspect his credentials very carefully. Another is simply, from a historical perspective, to want to find out how this horrible situation could have come into being in the first place.

Christopher

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by **Dan74 on Tue Dec 14, 2010 11:14 am**

Thanks, Christopher!

In regards to your second question, from my ill-informed perspective it looks like either inka doesn't mean very much these days, or Soen Roshi was not very careful in giving it.

Either way, buyer beware.
Dan74

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Genjo on Tue Dec 14, 2010 4:25 pm

The historical record is clear that Soen Roshi, Eido Roshi and many other Roshis have had doubts later about their own Dharma Heirs capacity to wholesomely transmit the lineage they have been entrusted with; really the only true test is that of time. As far as Junpo Denis Kelly is concerned he was an invited guest at the 2008, 40th Anniversary celebration of Shobo-Ji in Manhattan, and whatever troubles the two may have had in the past appeared resolved to me.

Genjo
Abbot of Dai Bai Zan Cho Bo Zen Ji (Chobo-Ji) temple, Seattle, USA; psychotherapist
and certificated spiritual director.

<http://www.choboji.org>
Genjo

Re: Eido Shimano's lineage...
by Dan74 on Tue Dec 14, 2010 10:52 pm

Thank you for making this clear, Genjo.
Dan74